NIETZSCHE’S PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION

In his first book, *The Birth of Tragedy*, Nietzsche observes that Greek tragedy gathered people together as a community in the sight of their gods, and argues that modernity can be rescued from 'nihilism' only through the revival of such a festival. This is commonly thought to be a view which did not survive the termination of Nietzsche’s early Wagnerianism, but Julian Young argues, on the basis of an examination of all of Nietzsche’s published works, that his religious communitarianism in fact persists through all his writings. What follows, it is argued, is that the mature Nietzsche is neither an ‘atheist’, an ‘individualist’ nor an ‘immoralist’: he is a German philosopher belonging to a German tradition of conservative communitarianism – though to claim him as a proto-Nazi is radically mistaken. This important reassessment will be of interest to all Nietzsche scholars and to a wide range of readers in German philosophy.

NIETZSCHE’S
PHILOSOPHY OF
RELIGION

JULIAN YOUNG
For

David Montgomery
## Contents

**Acknowledgements**

**List of abbreviations**

### Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Schopenhauer and ‘Man’s Need for Metaphysics’</td>
<td>1, 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Idealism and pessimism</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Birth of Tragedy</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The problem</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The question of Nietzsche’s own attitude</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Apollonianism</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dionysianism</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The role of myth</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The death of tragedy</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is wrong with the way we are now?</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Untimely Meditations</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Meditation: <em>David Strauss: The Confessor and the Writer</em></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Second Meditation: <em>Of the Uses and Disadvantage of History for Life</em></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Monumental history</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Antiquarian history</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Critical history</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>History not in the service of life</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Third Meditation: <em>Schopenhauer as Educator</em></td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The way we are now educator</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Educators</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fourth Meditation: <em>Richard Wagner at Bayreuth</em></td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The destitution of modernity</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wagnerian redemption</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The tragic effect</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

4 Human, All-too-Human 58
   Human, All-too-Human: A Book for Free Spirits 58
   The way we are now 61
   ‘Indicting’ God 62
   Science in life: (1) personal hygiene 68
   Science in life: (2) eugenics 69
   Science in life: (3) political science 70
   Religion in a post-modern world 71
   Art and the Greek revival 74
   The festival 79
   Cosmopolitanism 81
   Criticisms 83
   Death 84
   Daybreak 86

5 The Gay Science 88
   The familiar Nietzsche: the bloody-minded creative individualist 89
   The unfamiliar Nietzsche: conservatism and communitarianism 90
   The free spirit as the agent of growth: reconciliation of individualism and communitarianism 94
   Aspirations for the future 98
   Death 102

6 Thus Spoke Zarathustra 105
   Christianity 105
   Death 107
   Volk 111
   The festival 114
   Gods 117
   The child 118

7 Beyond Good and Evil 121
   Cultural criticism: (1) the ‘motley cow’ 121
   Cultural criticism (2) Christianity and its ‘shadows’ 122
   Overcoming diseased modernity: the ‘Führer’ principle 124
   Nietzsche’s Republic 132
   Religion in the new society 138
   The festival 143

8 On the Genealogy of Morals 145
   Genealogy 145
   Nobles and slaves 149
   Religion in the Genealogy 152
   Community in the Genealogy 155
   Postscript on the free spirit 155
Contents

9 The Wagner Case 157
   Wagner’s failings 157
   Positive lessons 159

10 Twilight of the Idols 161
   The decadence of democracy 161
   Compassionate conservatism 163
   The gods 166
   The Law of Manu 168
   Death and the Dionysian 171

11 The Antichrist 177
   Healthy versus unhealthy gods 177
   The Law of Manu again 179
   The Nachlass 185

12 Ecce Homo 190
   Why Nietzsche is not an ‘individualist’ 190
   Counter-indications 192
   The return of Dionysus 195

13 Epilogue: Nietzsche in history 201

Bibliography 216
   Works by Nietzsche 216
   Works by Schopenhauer 217
   Other works 217

Index 219
Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the German Academic Exchange Service, the University of Auckland Research Committee and the University of Auckland Arts Faculty for grants which supported the writing of this book. And to Christoph Jamme of the University of Lüneburg and Günter Seubold of the University of Bonn (where Nietzsche was briefly a student) for useful discussions of the substance of the work. I am grateful to Kathleen Higgins for helpful references to secondary literature concerning Zarathustra’s ‘Ass Festival’, and to Friedrich Voit for enlightening background information that only a Germanist would know. I am particularly grateful to my colleagues in the Auckland Philosophy Department, Robert Wicks, Markus Weidler, Rosalind Hursthouse and especially Christine Swanton who helped make my thoughts a lot clearer than they would otherwise have been. My greatest debt, however, is to the German historian Thomas Rohkrämer of the University of Lancaster who generously allowed me to read portions of the unpublished manuscript of his forthcoming study of the roots of National Socialism within the tradition of right-wing German thought, a study that is certain to become essential reading on the topic.
Abbreviations

Nietzsche’s works are cited using the following abbreviations: roman numerals refer to major parts of the works; arabic numerals refer to sections, not pages. The exceptions to this are (i) references to extraneous material included in translations of Nietzsche’s published works (generally editorial comments and excerpts from the Nachlass) in which case I cite page numbers, and (ii) references to KSA which I cite by volume number followed by the notebook number and, in brackets, the note number (e.g. 13 14 [204]). For bibliographical details of the works cited see pp. 216–17 below. Sometimes I have preferred my own translation to that provided in the translation cited.

A The Antichrist
BGE Beyond Good and Evil
BT The Birth of Tragedy
D Daybreak
EH Ecce Homo
GM On the Genealogy of Morals
GS The Gay Science
HH Human, All-too-Human
KSA Sämtliche Werke: Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden
NCW Nietzsche contra Wagner
TI Twilight of the Idols
UM Untimely Meditations
WC The Case of Wagner
WP The Will to Power
Z Thus Spoke Zarathustra

Schopenhauer’s works are cited as follows:
FR The Fourfold Root of the Principle of Sufficient Reason
PP Parerga and Paralipomena
WR The World as Will and Representation
Nietzsche spoke of "the death of God," and foresaw the dissolution of traditional religion and metaphysics. Some interpreters of Nietzsche believe he embraced nihilism, rejected philosophical reasoning, and promoted a literary exploration of the human condition, while not being concerned with gaining truth and knowledge in the traditional sense of those terms. Nietzsche’s intense association with Wagner no doubt enhanced his orientation towards the philosophy of Schopenhauer, and it probably promoted his work in aesthetics and cultural criticism. These biographical elements came to bear on Nietzsche’s first major works, while the middle period amounts to a confrontation with many of these influences.